

# 'Dairy' cows from the EU in Morocco - sold and slaughtered at local markets

A case study by Animals' Angels 2019 / 2020





#### Content

			page
Aim	of this rep	oort	02
I.	Backgro	ound	03
II.	Export t	ransports of 'breeding' animals to Morocco	04
III.	Animal	welfare and the legal situation in Morocco	04
IV.	Case st	udies 2019 - 2020	05
	1. Marl	ket in Mers El Kher	05
	1.1.	General information about the market	05
	1.2.	General observations concerning the bovine animals	06
	1.3.	EU cows found in Mers El Kher	07
	2. Marl	ket in Sidi Bennour	15
	2.1.	General information about the market	15
	2.2.	General observations concerning the bovine animals	16
	2.3.	EU cows found in Sidi Bennour	17
	3. Marl	ket in Souihla	20
	3.1.	General information about the market	20
	3.2.	General observations concerning the bovine animals	20
	3.3.	EU cows found in Souihla	21
٧.	Conclus	ion	25
Anne	Background  Export transports of 'breeding' animals to Morocco  Animal welfare and the legal situation in Morocco  Case studies 2019 – 2020  1. Market in Mers El Kher  1.1. General information about the market  1.2. General observations concerning the bovine animals  1.3. EU cows found in Mers El Kher  2. Market in Sidi Bennour  2.1. General information about the market  1.2. General observations concerning the bovine animals  2.1. General information about the market  1.2. General observations concerning the bovine animals  2.3. EU cows found in Sidi Bennour  3. Market in Souihla  3.1. General information about the market  3.2. General observations concerning the bovine animals  3.1. General information about the market  3.2. General observations concerning the bovine animals  3.3. EU cows found in Souihla  2.5. Conclusion  2.6. Conclusion  2.7. Conclusion  2.8. Ist of all bovine animals (incl. 'breeding' cows and 'fattening' bulls) with EU origin and observed by Animals' Angels in Morocco in 2019 and	26	
	EU origin	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	•

#### Aim of this report

This report aims to shed light on the conditions in which cows originating from the EU and once exported for breeding purposes are traded, transported, and even slaughtered at local markets and adjacent slaughterhouses in Morocco. Often it is argued that exported 'breeding' animals are treated differently than exported 'slaughter' animals. Our investigations in Morocco, however, paint a different picture. There is no way of controlling what happens to the animals once they leave the EU - regardless if they are "destined" for breeding or slaughter. In the end it makes no difference for the single animal anyway. Their suffering is the same.

Note: Animals' Angels expressly takes a stand against any form of discrimination and hostility against people of other cultures or religions. A lack of animal welfare is an international problem - not just that of individual countries. Therefore, we work internationally for better animal protection, compassion, and respect for animals. Our work is based on respectful dialogue and communication across cultural boundaries with all stakeholders involved.

Title picture: The Holstein cow Erika originally from Germany, sold at a local market in Morocco, 31.10.2020.



#### I. Background

The agricultural sector plays an important role in Morocco as it contributes about 14% of the gross domestic product per year and employs about 39% of the country's labour force. With the "Plan Maroc Vert" (Green Morocco Plan 2008-2018), the government launched an extensive reform plan in 2008 aiming to re-structure and modernize Morocco's agriculture, including animal production systems. The strategy "Génération Green 2020-2030" aims to further advance the modernisation plans of the Moroccan agricultural sector.

But still today the majority of 'farm' animals is kept by small-scale farmers. Particularly on the countryside, the families live with and from their animals who are regularly sold at local markets, so-called souks, that take place on a weekly basis.

Also 'dairy' cows are typically kept on small-scale farms with 95% of the cattle breeders having less than 10 cows per farm.<sup>4</sup> Often, these farms produce both, milk and meat.<sup>5</sup> So far, only few large dairy producers exist in Morocco compared with around 700,000 small-scale and often family-run dairy farms.<sup>6</sup> The majority of these small-scale farmers is member of dairy collection cooperatives which often produce for international companies like Central Danone (formerly Central Laitière) or Nestlé, or the cooperative dairy COPAG.<sup>7</sup>

Some regions in Morocco suffer regularly from heat, drought periods and water shortage, which also lead to feeding constraints. Especially small-scale farmers and their animals are negatively affected if they cannot afford the costs for animal food, for example. The situation becomes even more dramatic when they keep "high performance" 'dairy' cows from the EU who are not adapted to the climate challenges of the region. Local cattle breeds are more robust and acclimatised than European cows who require special diet and management as they easily get sick, infertile, and economically "inefficient". At the local markets, these cows are called "deficient" cows and often are traded under the worst animal welfare conditions.

 $<sup>^{1}\,\</sup>underline{\text{https://www.bmel-kooperationsprogramm.de/projekte/marokko/deutsch-marokkanisches-exzellenzzentrum-fuer-landwirtschaft/}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> http://www.agriculture.gov.ma/pages/la-strategie

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The new agricultural strategy aims to encourage the emergence of a new agricultural middle class (400,000 households) and young entrepreneurs, and to create 350,000 jobs. The aim is to double the share of the agricultural sector in GDP over the next 10 years. Animal welfare standards are not mentioned. See: <a href="https://maroc.ma/fr/actualites/la-strategie-relative-au-developpement-du-secteur-des-eaux-et-forets-se-base-sur-un">https://maroc.ma/fr/actualites/la-strategie-relative-au-developpement-du-secteur-des-eaux-et-forets-se-base-sur-un</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> https://www.fellah-trade.com/fr/filiere-animale/chiffres-cles-lait / Almost 80% of the dairy farms have with less than 5 cows and less than 5 ha according to <u>Srairi et al SpringerPlus 2013, 2:162</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Improving Livelihoods in Morocco: Needs Assessment of Small-Scale Cattle Farmers, D-Brief from MIT D-Lab Scale-Ups, 2014; https://www.fellah-trade.com/fr/filiere-animale/chiffres-cles-viandes-rouges

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> <u>Srairi et al SpringerPlus 2013, 2:162; Improving Livelihoods in Morocco: Needs Assessment of Small-Scale Cattle Farmers, D-Brief from MIT D-Lab Scale-Ups, 2014</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Oral information received by different dairy farmers. May/October/December 2019.

Dairy collection cooperatives "are generally a group of neighbouring farmers who install a refrigeration device to collect milk and aggregate it before delivering their output to dairy processing units." See <u>Srairi et al SpringerPlus 2013, 2:162</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Wirths, F. "Länderbeispiele verstärken Zweifel an Zuchtrinderexporten – Langstreckentiertransporte im Fokus", DTBI. 8/2020, S. 973 – 977.



#### II. Export transports of 'breeding' animals to Morocco

To build up an own breeding population of cattle, Morocco has been importing live animals since decades. This import business of live 'breeding' animals is still ongoing. Since years, Germany and France are by far the two major exporting EU countries concerning the export of female 'breeding' cattle to Morocco, followed by the Netherlands, Austria or Spain<sup>10</sup>.

According to Eurostat, 57,276 heifers and cows for breeding purposes were exported from the EU to Morocco in the last five years, with 10,493 female 'breeding' cattle alone in 2019.<sup>11</sup>

Export transports to non-EU countries like Morocco are broadly discussed in the EU. The recurring and systematic animal welfare problems during transport are well-known.<sup>12</sup>

Once arrived in Morocco, the imported animals have to be quarantined in an approved stable (so-called Lazaret stable) for about 15 – 21 days. Once the health status of the imported animals is considered good and the animals are accepted by the National Food Safety Authority (ONSSA), the imported cattle are further distributed to the local dairy farmers. Accordingly, it is often not traceable for EU authorities to which 'dairy' farm the animals will be sent after the completion of the quarantine. Latest when their milk production declines, many cows are re-sold and end up at local Moroccan markets where it is impossible to control what happens further to the animals (see case studies, chapter IV).

#### III. Animal welfare and the legal situation in Morocco

Agriculture, and in particular 'animal farming', is one of the most important economic pillars of Morocco. Nevertheless, Morocco has not yet adopted any animal welfare legislation.

I.e. there is no regulatory framework that lays down specific rules on the protection and welfare of 'farm' animals during transport, handling, on-farm management, in trade or during slaughter. Accordingly, there is also a significant lack of official controls concerning animal welfare.

Morocco is member of the World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE). Thus, Morocco has committed itself to comply with the animal welfare standards established by the OIE. Since the OIE is not an enforcement body every Member Country has to ensure itself that the standards are complied with by introducing the corresponding legislation and enforcement tools. However, this commitment is not reflected in any field of 'farm' animal activities and production in Morocco.<sup>14</sup>

 $<sup>^{9}</sup>$  E.g. in the year 2000, already 11,285 female 'breeding' cattle were exported from the EU to Morocco. See: Eurostat data, extracted on 10.11.2020

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Spain is leading in the export of cattle for fattening and slaughter to Morocco (e.g. 2019: 42,637 animals from ES compared to 46,062 cattle from whole EU, see Eurostat, category 010229 live cattle (excl. pure-bred for breeding).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/de/data/database, extracted on 10.11.2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> E.g. DG(SANTE) 2019-6834: Overview report on welfare of animals by road / DG(SANTE) 2019-6835: Overview report on welfare of animals by sea / Policy Brief " Why exports of live animals should not be approved to Morocco", Animals' Angels, April 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> According to information received by different dairy farmers and an owner of such Lazaret stable.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Already in 2014, Animals' Angels published a report about <u>"Farm" Animal Welfare in Morocco</u> and called upon the Moroccan authorities for an urgently needed legislation for the protection of 'farm' animals.

<sup>©</sup> Animals' Angels e.V. / Frankfurt a.M., Germany / November 2020



#### IV. Case studies 2019 - 2020

In 2019 and 2020, Animals' Angels visited three local Moroccan markets for several times – during each visit, the Animals' Angels team found bovine animals with European ear tags who were sold, transported and/or slaughtered there.

N.B.: The dates of visits were chosen randomly, and mostly started in the early morning hours between 05:00 – 06:00 am until noon or afternoon.

Location	visits in 2019	visits in 2020
Mers El Kher (market + slaughterhouse)	14.12.2019	31.10.2020 + 07.11.2020
Sidi Bennour (market + slaughterhouse)	08.10.2019 + 10.12.2019	03.11.2020
Souihla (market only)	11.12.2019	-

#### 1. Market in Mers El Kher

#### 1.1. General information about the market

The market in Mers El Kher takes place every Saturday. Adjacent to the market area, there is a slaughterhouse which is operating during the market day.

The wholesale market is divided into different sections including a bovine and sheep/goat selling area which only is a plain field surrounded by a wall. There is no infrastructure for the accommodation of animals, i.e. no pens, no railings to tie up the animals, no shade, no running water, no water troughs, and no stationary loading ramps. Due to the lack of infrastructure the overcrowded selling area becomes even more chaotic. There are no entrance controls concerning the animals and still unregistered animals are sold. Apart from sheep, goats and birds, all categories of bovine animals are sold: bulls and cows for slaughter, 'dairy' cows, calves of different ages and sex. Animals are observed panicking and trying to escape which leads to dangerous situations. Approx. 300 bovine animals are sold at this market every week.



Overview: cattle selling area in Mers El Kher, 14.12.2019.





Left: cows are tied very shortly to the wall, so that they cannot move their heads. They are standing in a rubbish field / right: entrance to the cattle selling area. Mers El Kher, 14.12.2019.

#### 1.2. General observations concerning the bovine animals

Sick, old, weak animals as well as animals unfit for transport are sold. Also, severely emaciated cows with Body Condition Score (BCS) <1.5. Cows with overgrown hooves and inflamed udders. Unweaned calves who are muzzled, with sunken flanks and suffering from diarrhoea. Blindfolded bulls and cows, animals tied by their legs. Some cattle have very dirty coats and appear neglected. Also, animals without identification are still found at the market (without ear tags). Inappropriate transport vehicles and brutal handling during loading is common practice.



Left: 'dairy' cow Fanny, with removed EU ear tag (acc. to information received by the owner). She is weak, emaciated and neglected. Fanny is sold for slaughter. Mers El Kher, 31.10.2020 / right: extremely emaciated/cachectic and neglected cow, BCS < 1. Regardless her very poor condition, she was transported to the market and is offered there for selling. Mers El Kher, 14.12.2019.





Left: Bull with blindfolded eyes. His front legs are tethered, and his head is tied with a rope to his front legs / right: this bull is trying to run away in panic, but his front legs are tethered together. He is only able to jump with his front legs when trying to move or walk. Mers El Kher, 14.12.2019.

#### 1.3. EU cows found in Mers El Kher

Among the bovine animals, we find several cows from the EU who were once exported to Morocco as 'breeding' animals and now are sold, inter alia, for slaughter:

#### Example 1: Cow Erika

Ear tag no.	DE 03 590 96874
MS of origin	Germany
Date and place of birth	05.05.2016 in Großefehn, Lower Saxony
History	02.03.2018: transport to assembly center Schirum/ VOST Aurich
Export to Morocco	22.03.2018
Animals' Angels observe	ations:
Location where found	Mers El Kher market, trailing to slaughterhouse in Ain Aouda
Date and time	<b>31.10.2020</b> , 07:45 – 10:20 am
Purpose at market	Sold for slaughter.
Conditions of cow	Coughing; BCS ~3
Further remarks	Loading of Erika:
	<ul> <li>Around 09:00 am she is loaded onto a vehicle totally inappropriate for the transport of animals: Transit Ford van, completely closed without ventilation and slippery floor that is covered with old excrements.</li> </ul>



- Erika is loaded as first cow. She slips off the loading ramp that has no lateral protection.
- A second cow (destined for slaughter) is loaded.
- Even though the van is already crowded with two cows, the workers start with the loading of a third cow. She is kicked, pushed and her tail is twisted to move her inside the vehicle but there is no space left. The third cow falls on the slippery ground of the vehicle and the workers close the rear door, regardless that the three cows inside have no space to move at all.
- As the third cow still lies on the ground, Erika and the second cow step on her due to lack of space.
- The workers realize that they have to unload the third cow again as the vehicle is too small/impossible to transport three cows.
- From the lateral door, the worker and driver start hitting and pushing Erika and the second cow with a wooden stick to move them away from the third cow on the floor. But as there is no space and their heads are shortly tied with a rope to the van, they cannot move at all. In the end, all three cows fall and lie above each other.
- An electric prod is used several times and randomly for all three cows. After many kicks and hits including into sensitive parts of the body, the workers manage to unload the third cow.

At 09:24 am, the transport with Erika and the second cow starts in direction slaughterhouse in Ain Aouda (coord. 33.791620, -6.801768) where they arrive around 10:00 am.

#### Observations in the slaughterhouse:

- Erika is tied in the middle of the slaughterhouse, next to three dead and deskinned cattle.
- Her front legs as well as her hint legs are tied together with a rope. Simultaneously, one man pulls at the rope around her front legs, another man pulls at the rope around her rear legs so that Erika falls onto her left side. Her head heavily hits the ground.
- She is breathing rapidly, and her eyes are wide-open.
- While she lies on the ground, her front and hint legs are additionally tied together. She tries to stand up several times but cannot move as her legs are tied together.
- Her head is positioned next to the drain full of blood.
- For more than 5 minutes Erika has to endure in this position before the butcher cuts Erika's throat with two cuts, down and up. After a few seconds, he cuts once again while checking the "quality" of the cuts.
- Erika tries to move/kick her legs, but she is still tied. Her tongue is hanging outside her mouth.
- At 10:15 am Erika is not moving anymore.

### Time in Morocco until cow found at market

#### 1 year 7 months





Left: Erika with German ear tag sold for slaughter at a local market. She is coughing repeatedly. Mers El Kher, 31.10.2020.





Loading of Erika. Due to the slippery floor (wet, dirty bedding), she falls off the ramp and struggles to stand up again. Mers El Kher, 31.20.2020.





Left: Erika is pulled by her tail to make her move. Next to her is loaded a second cow / right: a third cow is forced into the vehicle. There is no space, and she is heavily pushed and squeezed. Mers El Kher, 31.10.2020.



Due to lack of space and brutal handling (hitting, kicking, etc.) the animals start panicking and all three cows fall onto each other on board the vehicle (red arrow: Erika), Mers El Kher, 31.10.2020.

At the slaughterhouse in Ain Aouda:



The cow Erika has to wait inside the slaughterhouse next to dead bodies. Blood is covering the floor. Ain Aouda, 31.10.2020.



© Animals' Angels e.V. / Frankfurt a.M., Germany / November 2020





She is rapidly breathing, and her eyes are wide open. She has to remain in this position on the floor covered by blood and with all her legs tied together for five minutes before her throat is cut several times at full consciousness. Ain Aouda slaughterhouse, 31.10.2020.

#### Example 2: Cow Sandra

Ear tag no.	EZ <b>NL 6689 5452 9</b>
MS of origin	Netherlands
Date and place of birth	23.02.2016 in Beilen
History	22.01.2018: transport to assembly center Stegerman Vee Export in Zwolle
Export to Morocco	12.02.2018
Animals' Angels observe	ations:
Location where found	Mers El Kher, public slaughterhouse
Date and time	<b>14.12.2019</b> , 07:00 am
Purpose at market	For slaughter.
Conditions of cow	When Animals' Angels arrives at the slaughterhouse in Mers El Kher, the cow Sandra has already been killed, together with two other Holstein cows whose heads had been already taken off (thus impossible to identify/verify the origin of these cows).
Further remarks	At the slaughterhouse Mers El Kher, Animals' Angels has witnessed time and again severe animal welfare violations and extreme brutality against the animals. For example:



- Animals brought into the slaughterhouse with blindfolded eyes, tied by their horns, beaten with wooden sticks, kicked into sensible parts of the body, like their genitals or eyes, tail twisting.
- Very slippery floor inside the slaughterhouse, covered with blood so that the animals easily fall.
- To prepare the animals for the killing, they are thrown onto their side by pulling at their legs which are tied together.
- During the killing, often a man knees on the animal's body while the butcher is cutting the throat of the animal without prior stunning. Often, it is <u>not</u> only one single but several cuts.
- Often, animals tied inside the slaughterhouse for a long period of time (live animals surrounded by dead or dying animals).
- No entrance control even children walk and work in the slaughterhouse.
- No hygiene, no proper identification system of the animals who are killed there.

Time in Morocco until cow found at market

#### Ca. 1 year 10 months





The dead cow Sandra with Dutch ear tag - killed in the public slaughterhouse in Mers El Kher, 14.12.2019.

#### > Example 3: Cow Amelie

Ear tag no.	FR 25 4605 2743
MS of origin	France
Date and place of birth	February 2016, place unknown
History	unknown
Export to Morocco	February 2018
Animals' Angels observations:	
Location where found	Mers El Kher market



Date and time	14.12.2019, around 10am
Purpose at market	<b>Sold to farm</b> (acc. to information received from driver: 100 'dairy' cows as well as cows for meat production; located in Sidi Allal Elbahraoui, approx. 50km from Mers El Kher).
Conditions of cow	Full udder, loosing milk; BCS ~ 3
Conditions of cow  Further remarks	<ul> <li>Full udder, loosing milk; BCS ~ 3</li> <li>Loading of Amelie:         <ul> <li>Already three 'dairy' cows (Holstein) loaded on truck.</li> <li>The vehicle is not suitable for transporting animals: only very steep loading ramp without lateral protection; no roof top cover; insufficient space for transporting cattle.</li> <li>A red-brown cow (highly pregnant) is loaded as fourth cow on the truck. As the truck is too short, she has to stand in lateral position directly behind the three cows, looking to the right side of the vehicle and tied shortly with her head to the railing of the truck.</li> <li>As fifth cow, Amelie is loaded. There is no space for her at all.</li> <li>The driver stands on the vehicle and pushes the other pregnant cow further on the truck, to create some space for Amelie.</li> <li>He ties the rope of Amelie's halter around the railing of the truck and pulls from inside while a second man stands outside, next to Amelie and hits her with a wooden stick on the front legs and joints to make her move. She seems very stressed and afraid during the whole loading procedure. She pees repeatedly. Finally, Amelie steps with her front legs on the loading deck.</li> <li>Once Amelie is with her front legs on board the vehicle, the driver jumps out of the truck and twists her tail and pushes her from the back while the second man takes the rope of her halter and continues pulling her head.</li> <li>As there is no space for Amelie to step further on board the vehicle, the driver starts to push her laterally and turning her back in lateral position of the truck, with her head looking to the left.</li> <li>The rear of the truck is too small for Amelie's body, so the two men push and kick her heavily, also into her belly with the sharp end of the stick.</li> <li>She slips of the loading ramp with her left hint leg. Finally, the two men manage to get her on board while heavily t</li></ul></li></ul>
	ramp and tie her head to the left railing of the vehicle. She cannot move at all.  Both cows, Amelie and the other highly pregnant cow, have to bend their heads, as their bodies are too long for the vehicle.
Time in Morocco until cow found at market	Ca. 1 year 10 months









Loading of the French cow Amelie. Already four cows are loaded on board, and there is no further space for Amelie. Without proper loading ramp, it is more difficult for her to climb on board. The workers push and pull her onto the vehicle. Also, they heavily and repeatedly twist her tail and hit and push her with a stick, e.g. into her belly. The vehicle is too short so that Amelie and the other cow in lateral position can only stand with bended head. Mers El Kher market, 14.12.2019.



#### 2. Market in Sidi Bennour

#### 2.1. General information about the market

The market in Sidi Bennour is considered as one of the biggest livestock markets in Morocco. It takes place every Tuesday. Next to the market is a public slaughterhouse which is operating during the market day.

The place is extremely crowded and chaotic. There is no infrastructure, i.e. no pens, no proper railings, no watering facilities, no shade. The ground is mainly consisting of a slippery deep and layer of sand, mud, urine and faeces. Stationary loading ramps are lacking. There is no entrance control or any other official check concerning animal health and welfare. Beside sheep and few equines (in separate area), approx. 2,000 – 2,500 bovine animals are regularly sold at this market.



Overview of cattle area, Sidi Bennour market, 10.12.2019 (early morning hour): overcrowded and chaotic situation at the market.



Public slaughterhouse next to the market of Sidi Bennour, 10.12.2019



#### 2.2. General observations concerning the bovine animals

Many animals are in poor condition: emaciated, with BCS less than 1.5, cows with deformed, inflamed and full udders, animals with overgrown hooves, dull and dirty coats, animals with diarrhoea, nasal discharge, strong salivation, or respiratory problems. Animals who are injured, sick and/or severely lame are sold at the market and transported. E.g. some bovines bleed from their noses or have broken horns. Others are blindfolded and tied by their legs. Very young calves with naval cord still visible and sunken flanks are sold, too.





Left: extremely emaciated cow sold at the market, Sidi Bennour, 10.12.2019 / right: Moroccan cow who lost her right eye – injury full of pus. Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.





Cow Anouk has only three legs. The lower part from the carpal region of her right front leg is missing. She is unfit for transport as she cannot walk properly and is unable to keep balance. Nevertheless, she is loaded on the second deck of a vehicle (without loading ramp). Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.





This 'dairy' cow cannot bear weight on her four legs. She is thin and heavily lame, suffering from a severe and very painful inflammation in her right hint leg (ankle area). She is <u>not</u> fit for transport but sold at the market of Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.



#### 2.3. EU cows found in Sidi Bennour

In these unbearable conditions, we find many cows who were born in the EU and exported as 'breeding' animals to Morocco to start abroad a "career" as 'dairy' cow. Among them are:

#### > Example 4: Cow Hilda

Ear tag no.	DE 05 398 11059
MS of origin	Germany
Date and place of birth	05.05.2017 in Willebadessen, North Rhine-Westphalia
History	22.01.2019: transported to Rinder-Union-West eG, Münster
	25.01.2019: transported to VOST e.G. Aurich (assembly center Schirum), from there exported.
Export to Morocco	07.02.2019
Animals' Angels observa	ations:
Location where found	Sidi Bennour market
Date and time	03.11.2020, 07:22 am
Purpose at market	Sold together with other cows from the EU at the market – no information if she is sold for slaughter or further milk production.
Conditions of cow	Thin, BCS 2
Further remarks	She is tied very shortly to a wall so that she cannot properly move her head.
Time in Morocco until cow found at market	< 1 year 9 months





Left: Ear tag of the cow Hilda / right: Hilda sold next to other 'dairy' Holstein cows at the market Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.



#### > Example 5: Cow Fabienne

Ear tag no.	FR 25 4308 1926
MS of origin	France
Date and place of birth	February 2016, place unknown
History	unknown
Export to Morocco	Likely March 2018
Animals' Angels observe	ations:
Location where found	Sidi Bennour market
Date and time	10.12.2019, 09:24 am
Purpose at market	No information if she is sold for slaughter or further milk production.
Conditions of cow	BCS 3
Further remarks	Fabienne is tied with many other 'dairy' cows to a wall inside the market area, standing ankle-deep in wet and muddy dirt.
Time in Morocco until cow found at market	Ca. 1 year 9 months

Left: Ear tag of Fabienne / right: Fabienne sold at the market in filthy conditions. Sidi Bennour, 10.12.2019.

#### > Example 6: Cow Francesca

Ear tag no.	FR 25 2276 2038
MS of origin	France
Date and place of birth	December 2015, place unknown
History	unknown
Export to Morocco	Likely April 2018
Animals' Angels observations:	
Location where found	Sidi Bennour market



	we are there with the animals
Date and time	08.10.2019, 08:45 - 10:22 am
Purpose at market	Sold for slaughter.
Conditions of cow	The face of the cow is covered with a plastic cloth. She is partly blindfolded (also during loading).
Further remarks	<ul> <li>Loading of Francesca:</li> <li>Together with 9 cows on a multipurpose vehicle not suited for animal transport, without proper loading ramp (only very steep one), no roof top cover</li> <li>Brutal handling during loading, with tail twisting</li> <li>Severely overloaded truck, the animals are packed next to each other without being able to slightly move</li> <li>Bovines with horns and without horns loaded together</li> <li>The transport is heading to a slaughterhouse in Marrakech (ca. 150 km away).</li> </ul>
Time in Morocco until cow found at market	Ca. 1 year 6 months







Left top: Francesca with French and Moroccan ear tag and a plastic cloth attached to her halter.

Right top: loading of Francesca on inadequate vehicle. She is blindfolded, the loading ramp is too steep, and the worker is heavily twisting her tail.

Left: Severely overloaded transport – Francesca (red arrow) is squeezed with other cattle (with and without horns) on the vehicle. The animals are not able to move at all.

All pictures taken at Sidi Bennour market, 08.10.2019.



#### 3. Market in Souihla

#### 3.1. General information about the market

The weekly market in Souihla takes places every Wednesday. There is no slaughterhouse attached to the market. Sheep (in separate area) and approx. 1,500 – 2,000 bovines are sold at the market. The market area is surrounded by a wall. Like at the other markets, inside the selling area it is very crowded and chaotic. The lack of infrastructure worsens the situation. Also at this market, there are no pens, no proper railings for tying up the animals, no watering facilities, no shade. The floor of the market is a mix of sand, mud and excrements, partly with puddles of water. At the parking where most the loading of the animals takes place there is a stationary loading ramp for multi-deck vehicles, but none for one deck vehicles. Entrance controls of the animals do not take place, as well as unregistered animals are still sold at this market.



Overview - cattle selling area at market in Souihla, 11.12.2019.

#### 3.2. General observations concerning the bovine animals

Like found in the other markets, also to this market animals in very poor conditions are brought: many extremely emaciated, thin cows – often with BCS less than 1.5. Most of them are sold for fattening and/or slaughter. Unweaned calves with sunken flanks and diarrhoea, injured animals with bloody noses (often caused due to beating in their faces), or broken horns. Cows with overgrown hooves, and sick animals with inflamed udders, respiratory problems, nasal discharge, diarrhoea, dull and very dirty coats. A downer cow - we name her Ouarda - is left to her fate next to the market. Nobody takes care of her. She is too weak to stand up, and her BCS is below 1.







Left: 'Dairy' cows are tied together by their horns, standing in mud / right: downer cow Ouarda left to her fate, without any medical treatment or emergency killing. Both pictures: market in Souihla, 11.12.2019.





Left: Thin and dirty cow with baby calf sold at market / right: Cow Amelia is blind on both eyes. Her front legs are tied together and her udder is very full. In panic she trys to escape and "runs" into other animals. Her owner did not tie her at a calm and safe place by her halter nor is he with her. Both pictures: market in Souihla, 11.12.2019.

#### 3.3. EU cows found in Souihla

At this market many 'dairy' cows are sold either for further milk production or for slaughter. Many cows are Holstein Frisian, Montbéliard or cross breeds. Several cows have holes in their ears from old and removed ear tags. Among the cows, we find a French and a German cow.

#### Example 7: Cow Frida

Ear tag no.	DE 03 595 85801
MS of origin	Germany
Date and place of birth	11.04.2017 in Burgwedel, Lower Saxony
History	12.01.2019: transport to Masterrind GmbH Sulingen
	23.01.2019: transport to assembly center Schoppe Livestock in Messingen (Emsland), from there exported.
Export to Morocco	05.02.2019
Animals' Angels observations:	



Lander barrets at	we are there with the animals
Location where found	Souihla market (later trailing to Tamallalt)
Date and time	11.12.2019, 06:30 – 14:20
Purpose at market	Sold for slaughter.
Conditions of cow	BCS 3-4; during the market she appears tired and exhausted
Further remarks	Loading of Frida:
	<ul> <li>Truck <u>not</u> appropriate for animal transport: only a very steep, slippery opening flap at the rear; completely closed vehicle without proper openings; no ventilation.</li> <li>Overloaded transport conditions: already 4 cattle on board incl. heavy bull of approx. 600-700 kg.</li> <li><u>Brutal handling during loading</u>: Frida is pulled and pushed inside the truck. Due to the steep and slippery "loading ramp" and the insufficient space inside the vehicle, she slips away and falls with her legs and belly on the ramp. The man behind her grabs her tail and twists it, while another worker is kicking her with his foot on the hint leg and back. She is hit with a wooden stick while constantly twisting her tail to push her inside the truck.</li> <li>A blindfolded bull is loaded directly afterwards and pushed inside the vehicle.</li> </ul>
	Trailing (between 12:04 – 13:58) and unloading in Tamallalt at coordinates 31.819672, -7.511921 (next to street):
	<ul> <li>There is a wall (50 cm) just next to the street where Frida and three bulls are unloaded. There is no lateral protection, and the animals could easily step or fall down the wall.</li> <li>One bull is unloaded while still being blindfolded.</li> <li>After unloading, Frida and the other three bulls are brought to a "stable" (like a garage of a private house, at coord. 31.818696, -7.512364). The garage is very dark and empty, with some rubbish around. As the Animals' Angels team is not allowed to enter, we have no further information but are told that Frida and the other bulls will be slaughtered in the next days in one of the slaughterhouses at the weekly markets.</li> <li>The two other cattle still on board the vehicle are transported to another buyer (also for slaughter).</li> </ul>
Time in Morocco until cow found at market	~10 months





Left: Frida sold for slaughter at the market (red arrow shows Frida) / right: German ear tag of Frida. Both pictures: Souihla, 11.12.2019.



Loading of Frida onto a closed truck. There is not sufficient space inside the compartment as already heavy bulls are loaded. Frida falls down on the steep and slippery loading ramp. Souihla, 11.12.2019.





Left: Unloading of the first 'slaughter' bull (blindfolded), Frida is unloaded secondly (no photo available) / right: Frida (see red arrow) and the blindfolded bull are led along the road to the garage (coordinates 31.818696, -7.512364) before they will be slaughtered in the coming days. Both pictures: Tamallalt, 11.12.2019.



#### > Example 8: Cow Matilde

Ear tag no.	FR 79 4939 0613
MS of origin	France
Date and place of birth	unknown
History	unknown
Export to Morocco	unknown
Animals' Angels observe	ations:
Location where found	Souihla market
Date and time	<b>11.12.2019</b> , ca. 08:30 am
Purpose at market	Unknown, according to her condition likely sold for fattening and slaughter.
Conditions of cow	Very thin, BCS <2, with old, encrusted patches of dirt on her back, legs and udder.
Further remarks	She is hit in her face by her owner.
Time in Morocco until cow found at market	unknown





Left: French ear tag of Matilde / right: Matilde is very skinny and her back is covered with old incrusted dirt. Souihla market, 11.12.2019.

#### → For further examples, please see Annex A.



#### V. Conclusion

The export of live animals to Morocco – regardless if they are "destined" for slaughter or breeding purposes – is irresponsible.

Often, the handling, transport and slaughter of animals take place under the worst animal welfare conditions and would be classified as cruelty to animals under EU law. Not even the internationally agreed OIE's (minimum) animal welfare standards on transport and slaughter are met.

As the present report shows, also 'high performance breeding' cows from the EU are not spared from being sold in neglected, poor and unfit conditions at local markets. They are beaten, kicked, dragged, and maltreated with electro prods during loading procedures as well as killed by untrained personal at full consciousness.

The EU can no longer turn a blind eye to what is happening to its hundreds of thousands of animals outside the Union's borders. Export operators, cattle breeding associations, dairy farmers, authority officials and policy makers on national and EU level must finally take responsibility for what they do respectively do not do. The European Union must set clear limits to purely economic interests.

According to Article 13 TFEU, the EU and its Member States have to pay full regard to the welfare needs of animals as sentient beings when implementing and formulating Union's policies. It is high time to translate this principle into reality!



For Fanny and all the other cows in Morocco whose ways have crossed ours in the last two years... We could not alleviate their suffering, and only their stories are left.



#### Annex A: Further photographic evidence





Left: French cow Fleur (FR 70 2620 8846) before loading - blindfolded and with bloody nasal discharge / right: Holstein cow Janna (DE 14 0373 7793) in poor condition (emaciated). Both: Sidi Bennour, 08.10.2019.





Left: Dutch cow Femke, NL 6706 63240, tied together with other cows and calves; no space to move / right: French cow Agnes, FR 85 6331 8385. She is losing milk. Both pictures: Sidi Bennour market, 10.12.2019.





Left: Dutch cow (NL .... 0141?) sold at market / right: German cow Marie (DE 03 5743 6747) blindfolded with plastic cloth and tied very shortly to the ground so that she cannot raise her head. Both pictures: Sidi Bennour, 10.12.2019.





The Austrian cow with ear tag AT 37 1645 338 is sold with her muzzled baby calf at the local market in Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.



Left: The German cow Linda (DE 01 208 95 764) is sold at the market to another dairy farm. She is loaded with two other cows on a Mercedes Transit van which is not suited for the transport of animals (no space, no ventilation, no loading ramp). The bedding is an accumulation of old excrements from previous animals. / right: Dutch cow with NL 92 6790 8019 080. She is very skinny (BCS  $\sim$ 1), stands with arched back and her udder is very full. Both pictures: Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.



Left: French cow, ear tag FR 39 2501 1636. Her front legs are tethered so that she cannot walk at all (red arrow). Additionally, she is blindfolded (plastic sac covering her eyes/face) / right: German cow with ear tag DE 06 670 36 301 (and MAR 03BE001941610) sold at market. Both pictures: Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.



Left: French cow with ear tag FR 56 1366 4639. She is very dirty. Her flanks are deeply sunken, and her udder is full and losing milk. In front of her stands her baby (muzzled, not allowed to drink from his mother's milk) / right: French cow with ear tag FR 49 7469 7183. She is lame and cannot put weight on her right front leg. Her udder is full and seems inflamed. Both pictures: Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.



Left: German cow Polly (DE 05 388 28 390) with her muzzled calf, tied between rubbish. Polly's udder is full and her back is dirty from old, encrusted mud/excrements / right: Polly's face covered by flies. Both pictures: Mers El Kher, 07.11.2020.



The weak 'dairy' cow Fanny (from EU, without ear tag identification) is loaded on a multipurpose vehicle without proper ramp. The tailgate is too steep to serve as loading ramp. Fanny is sold for slaughter. She is maltreated repeatedly with an electric prod and her tail is twisted. Her eyes are wide open, and she vocalizes/moans repeatedly. Mers El Kher, 31.10.2020.





Fanny is pulled onto the vehicle with a rope around her left front leg as she is too weak to jump on her own. A second worker repeatedly gives her electro shocks with an electric prod into her genital area (red circle). Mers El Kher, 31.10.2020.







Left top: Fanny is dragged inside the vehicle.

Right top: On board, she cannot stand up. The worker (in the middle of the picture) jumps behind her, in his right hand the electric prod (red circle).

Left: Again, Fanny is repeatedly maltreated with electric shocks, while two workers pull heavily at her head. She vocalizes/moans in pain and refuses resp. cannot to stand up.

All pictures: Mers El Kher, 31.10.2020.







Left: French cow Maya (FR 25 4461 1911) with an eye inflamation / right: Loading of Maya on a double-deck vehicle without loading ramp (!). On board there is no space for Maya. She is kicked and beaten with the wooden stick into her face and other sensitive body parts. Her tail is twisted again and again. While Maya's loading procedure, another cow jumps out of the vehicle again. Maya still refuses to jump on board and tries to escape several times. Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.





Maya's loading takes nearly 10 minutes...until she finally jumps onto the vehicle. The second deck (or at least the rear opening) is too low so that she hits the ceiling with her back (red arrow). Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.





Examples of typical loading of cattle on the second deck of double-deck vehicles. The animals are lifted by their tail and several ropes around their body by a group of men standing on the second deck while one or two men push from below/under the animal's body. Second deck without roof top cover or any other security measures. Both pictures: Sidi Bennour, 03.11.2020.



## Annex B: List of all bovine animals (incl. 'breeding' cows and 'fattening' bulls) with EU origin and observed by Animals' Angels in Morocco in 2019 and 2020

No	Ear tag number	Name /	EU origin	Found in Morocco by AA		Comments
		Description		When?	Where?	
1	DE 03 5832 0065	Leni / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	Germany	20.05.2019	road N7, direction Sidi Bennour	Tied next to road for grazing. Low BCS Born: 06.11.2015 4x changing place in DE between 24.11.2016 and 15.02.2018 Export nach MA: 15.02.2018 via Masterrind Bremervörde and assembly center Johan Wacht (Wincheringen).
2	FR 70 3881 7423	Claire / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	20.05.2019	road N7, direction Sidi Bennour	Tied next to road for grazing.
3	DE 14 0373 7793	Janna / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Germany	08.10.2019	Sidi Bennour market	Sold for slaughter at market / extremely sunken flanks, emaciated / BSC 1. Born: 23.12.2010 4x changing place in DE between 10.01.2011 and 25.02.2013 Export to MA: 11.03.2013 via RBB Rinderproduktion.
4	FR 70 2620 8846	Fleur / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	08.10.2019	Sidi Bennour market	Sold for slaughter at market / Blindfolded and tied to a truck / bloody nasal discharge.
5	FR 25 4274 4629	Juliette / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	08.10.2019	Sidi Bennour market	Sold for slaughter at market
6	FR 25 2435 3054	Nadine / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	08.10.2019	Sidi Bennour market	Her head tied very short to the ground; she is unable to lift the head but has to keep it down. Lame on right hint leg.
7	FR 25 2276 2038	Francesca / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	08.10.2019	Sidi Bennour market	Sold for slaughter at market / See example 6.
8	DE 12 704 65646	Elisa / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Germany	10.12.2019	Sidi Bennour market	Sold for slaughter at market Emaciated, neglected, dirty, BCS 1. Born: 17.04.2007 1x changing place in DE to RBB Rinderproduktion on 02.03.2009. From there



Export to MA: 19.03.2009 Sold for slaughter at DE 03 574 36747 Marie / Germany 10.12.2019 Sidi Bennour Holstein market market / blindfolded and tied too short. Frisian cow, black-coloured Born: 21.11.2014 1x changing place in DE to VOST Aurich on 20.03.2017. From there **Export to MA:** 30.03.2017 10.12.2019 Born: 29.03.2015 10 NL 6706 63240 Sidi Bennour Femke / Nether-Holstein lands market 2x changing place in NL between 12.11.2015 Frisian cow, black-coloured and 05.12.2016. Export: 20.12.2016 via Zwolle/NL. NL ???? 0141? Nether-10.12.2019 Sidi Bennour No info. 11 Holstein Frisian cow, lands market black-coloured 10.12.2019 Together with her baby 12 FR 85 6331 8385 Sidi Bennour Agnes / France calf (muzzled) at 'dairy' cow, market black-coloured market and sold separately. Agnes with BCS < 1.5, dirty coat from old, encrusted mud and excrements on her back, legs and udder. FR 56 3878 0601 10.12.2019 Tied together with other 13 Rosa / France Sidi Bennour Holstein market EU and Moroccan cows and calves. No further Frisian cow. black-coloured info. 14 FR 25 4308 1926 Fabienne / France 10.12.2019 Sidi Bennour See example 5. 'dairy' cow, market red-coloured 10.12.2019 15 FR 25 3076 2093 Gerlinde / Sidi Bennour Sold for slaughter at France 'dairy' cow, market market. red-coloured FR 70 3637 5625 Sidi Bennour Sold with two other 16 Breda / France 10.12.2019 'dairy' cow, market 'dairy' cows and a very red-coloured young calf. No further info. 17 FR 90 2386 1762 Mirabelle / France 10.12.2019 Sidi Bennour Tied on a rope with at least 10-15 other cows 'dairy' cow, market red-coloured (in a circle); rope hold by one man standing in the middle of the circle. Low BCS with rips well visible and sunken flanks. No further info. FR ?? ???? 7754 10.12.2019 Sidi Bennour Sold for slaughter at 18 Pauline / France market. Next to her is 'dairy' cow, market red-coloured another French cow (ear tag no readable), also sold for slaughter.



						we are there with the animals
19	DE 03 595 85801	Frida / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Germany	11.12.2019	Souihla market	Sold for slaughter at market. See example 7.
20	FR 79 4939 0613	Matilde / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	France	11.12.2019	Souihla market	See example 8.
21	NL 6689 5452 9	Sandra / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Nether- lands	14.12.2019	Mers El Kher slaughter- house	Already dead when found. See example 2.
22	FR 25 4605 2743	Amelie / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	14.12.2019	Mers El Kher market	See example 3.
23	FR 70 4351 3747	Anna / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	14.12.2019	Mers El Kher market	Sold with her young calf (muzzled). Full udder, losing milk. Belly, legs and udder dirty with old, encrusted mud and excrements.
24	DE 03 590 96 874	Erika / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Germany	31.10.2020	Mers El Kher market + Ain Aouda slaughter- house	Slaughter documented. See example 1.
25	DE 06 670 36 301	Dorle / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Germany	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Tied very short, next to other cows. Small injuries on her legs and dirty legs and belly (encrusted excrements). She seems very nervous and anxious, especially when approaching her. Born: 18.02.2017 4x changing place in DE between 22.10.2018 and 09.11.2018  Export to MA:  09.11.2018  Export via Haller (Viehhandel).
26	DE 01 208 95764	Linda / Holstein cow, red-coloured	Germany	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Tied very short at a wall, next to at least 6 other cows (also from EU). She cannot move properly and is placed next to an area that is used as human toilet. Filthy area and strong smell. Sold for milk production. Loaded and transported on "Mercedes Sprinter" van without ventilation and old, filthy bedding. Two other cows are loaded, too.
© Animals' Angels e.V. / Frankfurt a.M., Germany / November 2020 33						



						Born: 08.01.2013		
						3x changing place in DE between 29.10.2014 and 14.11.2014 Export to MA: 14.11.2014		
						via Haller (Viehhandel).		
27	DE 05 398 11059	Hilda / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Germany	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	See example 4.		
28	AT 371645338	Eva / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	Austria	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold at market – no info for which purpose. Next to her muzzled calf who continuously tries to drink.  Born: ~ Oct. 2016 in Salzburg  Export to MA:  November 2018  from Sankt Veit an der Glan, Kärnten.		
29	FR 01 1603 4252	Marisa / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold at market – no info for which purpose. Udder very full and loosing milk.		
30	FR 25 3710 7728	Daphne / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold at market – no info for which purpose. Udder full of milk and inflamed. Low BCS with sunken flanks and protruding rips.		
31	FR 25 4461 1911	Maya / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold at market – no info for which purpose. Full udder, nasal discharge, and very inflamed left eye (with pus). Brutal loading documented incl. hitting with wooden stick heavily in her face, tail twisting, no loading ramp, double-deck vehicle not appropriate for animal transport.		
32	FR 39 2501 1636	Emma / 'dairy' cow, red-coloured	France	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold at market – no info for which purpose. Front legs tied by a rope, unable to walk; blindfolded with plastic cloth.		
33	FR 49 7469 7183	Ana / 'dairy' cow, black-coloured	France	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold at market – no info for which purpose (her new owner just has bought her at the market in the morning and tries to resell her now).  She is lame and cannot put weight on her right front leg; low BCS; full udder.		
© An	© Animals' Angels e.V. / Frankfurt a.M., Germany / November 2020 34							



						we are there with the animals
34	FR 56 1366 4639	Michelle / 'dairy' cow, black-coloured	France	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold at market – no info for which purpose. Skinny, with abrasion in the pelvic area (at least right side); dirty on hint legs, belly and udder; full udder losing milk (while her baby is muzzled).
35	FR 85 4029 1343	Elvira / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	France	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold at market – no info for which purpose, likely for slaughter. Very dirty; skinny and neglected.
36	NL 9267 9080 1	Dagmar / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Nether- lands	03.11.2020	Sidi Bennour market	Sold for slaughter at market. Very skinny, BSC <1.5 Born: 24.08.2012 in Sebaldeburen 2x changing in NL between 25.09.2012 and 26.02.2014 Export: 13.03.2014 from Hilaard.
37	DE 05 388 28 390	Polly / Holstein Frisian cow, black-coloured	Germany	07.11.2020	Mers El Kher market	Sold with her muzzled calf; full udder and flies sitting on her face. Neglected conditions.
Bulls	s from the EU found	by Animals' Angel	s at Morocc	an markets in 2	2019/2020:	
38	ES001008929449	Leon / bull for slaughter	Spain	30.03.2019	Mers El Kher slaughter- house	Slaughter documented.
39	ES050813397722	Ernesto / bull for slaughter	Spain	05.10.2019	Mers El Kher slaughter- house	Slaughter documented.
40	ES040307962776	Paulo / bull for fattening	Spain	05.10.2019	Mers El Kher market	Sold for breeding purposes (acc. to information received by the buyer). Blindfolded with plastic sac.
41	ES08081278?323	Javier / bull for slaughter	Spain	05.10.2019	Mers El Kher market	Sold for slaughter.
42	ES031402922050	Bull for slaughter	Spain	10.12.2019	Sidi Bennour slaughter- house	Slaughter documented.
43	ES060605001427	Francis / bull for slaughter	Spain	31.10.2020	Mers El Kher market	Sold for slaughter.

N.B.: This list is not exhaustive. It only represents those animals who could be easily identified by country. Animals' Angels has seen numerous more 'dairy' cows and 'fattening' respectively 'slaughter' bulls who originally came from the EU (but no longer identifiable by EU origin) and were sold or killed at local markets in Morocco.